

# EVALUATION AND RANKING COMMITTEE MEETING

JULY 1, 2020

RFP #20-03-390

## FINANCIAL AUDITING SERVICES

### VENDOR PRESENTATION AND FINAL RANKING

#### MINUTES

The Evaluation and Ranking Committee for Financial Auditing Services met July 1, 2020, for the purpose of receiving firm presentations and final rankings at the July 1, 2020 evaluation meeting. The meeting began at 10:05 a.m. The meeting was held virtually utilizing Communications Media Technology (CMT) in accordance with Governor Ron DeSantis' Executive Order No. 20-69, dated March 20, 2020 and Executive Order No. 20-150 dated June 23, 2020 related to conducting local government public meetings while under the public health emergency related to the spread of Novel Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19). The conducting of virtual meetings is subject to potential change or modification and reversion to non-virtual, in-person public meetings under Ch. 286, FS, dependent upon Executive Orders of the Governor. City Hall building is closed to the public.

#### **Evaluation Committee Members Present:**

Chair Ana M. Ziade, Mayor, City of North Lauderdale

Christine Cajuste, Interim Finance Director, City of Tamarac

Susan Gooding - Liburd, Chief Financial Officer, City of Miramar

Peta Gay-Lake, Director of Finance and Administrative Services, City of Coconut Creek

#### **City of North Lauderdale Staff present:**

Susan Nabors, Finance Director

Danielle Keira-Cancel, Accounting & Purchasing Coordinator

Danielle Schwabe, Associate Attorney, Goren, Cherof, Doody, and Ezrol, P.A.

#### **GLSC & Company, PPLC Team Members Present:**

Pablo Llerena, CPA, Engagement Partner

Gina Cabral, CPA, Quality Control Reviewer

Athalia Bowrey, CPA Senior Auditor

Usette Casares, CPA Audit Senior Manager

#### **Marcum LLP Team Members Present:**

Michael Futterman, Quality Control Director

Brandon Lopez, Audit Manager

Nicholas Horn, Audit Supervisor

Jose Antigua, Audit Risk Director

#### **Keefe McCullough Team Members Present:**

William Benson, Managing Partner

Marc Grace, Partner

Michael Barnett, Supervisor

Jose Ortiz, Supervisor

**The following firms presented:**

1. GLSC & Company – Pablo Llerena and team members presented a proposal to provide independent auditing services based on a power point presentation. The presentation and question and answer session beginning 10:05 a.m. concluding at 10:27 a.m.
2. Marcum, LLP. – Moises Ariza and team members presented a proposal to provide independent auditing services based on a power point presentation and question and session beginning at 10:32 a.m. and concluding at 11:01 a.m.
3. Keefe McCullough – William Benson and team members presented a proposal to provide independent auditing services and question and session beginning at 11:04 a.m. and concluding at 11:24 a.m.

At the conclusion of each presentation Danielle, Accounting & Purchasing Coordinator informed each firm regarding the Cone of Silence and that city personnel and or Evaluation Committee Members have been instructed not to answer any questions off of the record. Any questions can be emailed to [dkcancel@nlauderdale.org](mailto:dkcancel@nlauderdale.org). The attending firms were advised to check DemandStar.com and the City of North Lauderdale’s website for the final ranking from today’s presentations.

**Discussion:**

The Evaluation Committee discussed the ranking of each firm. Attorney Schwabe instructed the evaluators to advise if their ranking changed or remained the same from the previous Bid opening. Danielle Keira-Cancel calculated the ranking of each Evaluation Committee Member for each firm and read the final tabulation of calculations into the record as follows, from first to last:

<b>Company</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
<b>1. Keefe McCullough</b>	<b>91%</b>
<b>2. GSLC &amp; Company</b>	<b>88.04%</b>
<b>3. Marcum, LLP.</b>	<b>88.02%</b>

Evaluation Committee Member Susan Gooding – Liburd moved to adopt the ranking scores. Seconded by Evaluation Committee Member Peta Gay – Lakes. Attorney Schwabe took the roll. All YES. MOTION PASSED.

A copy of the final ranking sheet is attached to these Minutes. The Evaluation Committee recommended submitting this item to the City Commission for consideration and adoption on July 14, 2020.

No further discussion, the meeting adjourned at 11:59 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,  
Patricia Vancheri, City Clerk  
Transcribed by Elizabeth Garcia-Beckford, Deputy City Clerk



1

## EVALUATION COMMITTEE SCORING SUMMARY SCORING FORM – KEEFE MCCULLOUGH RANKING

Rank # 3

RFP # 20-03-390 Financial Auditing Services

<u>Criteria</u>	<u>Possible Points</u>	<u>Ana Ziade</u>	<u>Christine Cajuste</u>	<u>Peta-Gay Lake</u>	<u>Susan Gooding-Liburd</u>	
<b>Firm Qualifications</b> (past experience and performance on comparable government engagements). See section 150 (b)	25	23 <small>25</small>	23	24	24 <small>25</small>	
<b>Management, Supervisory and Staff Experience.</b> The quality, expertise and experience of the firm's professional personnel to be assigned to the engagement and the ability to provide the required services. See section 15 (c)	20	18 <small>19</small>	17	20	17 <small>19</small>	
<b>Adequacy of proposed staffing plan</b> for various segments of the engagement, including supervision and involvement of experienced personnel.	10	9	8	7	8 <small>9</small>	
Adequacy of sampling techniques and audit work plan	10	9 <small>10</small>	9	10	9 <small>9</small>	
Adequacy of analytical and substantive procedures	10	10 <small>10</small>	9	10	9 <small>9</small>	
<b>Pricing.</b> Rates and expenses.	20	18.25	18.25	18.25	18.25	
<b>Local Vendor Preference</b> (5 Points-North Lauderdale business; 2.5 Points-Broward business)	5	2.5	2.5	2.5	2.5	
<b>TOTAL</b>	100					<b>AVERAGE</b>
<b>MEMBER TOTALS</b>		89.75	86.75	91.75	87.75	89

*[Signature]*

4/24/2020

91.75

91

Purchasing Signature

Date

93.75



# EVALUATION COMMITTEE SCORING SUMMARY SCORING FORM – GLSC & COMPANY RANKING

Rank #

1

RFP # 20-03-390 Financial Auditing Services

Criteria	Possible Points	Ana Ziade	Christine Cajuste	Peta-Gay Lake	Susan Gooding-Liburd	
Firm Qualifications (past experience and performance on comparable government engagements). See section 150 (b)	25	25 24	25	24	25 23	
Management, Supervisory and Staff Experience. The quality, expertise and experience of the firm's professional personnel to be assigned to the engagement and the ability to provide the required services. See section 15 (c)	20	18	18	19	18	
Adequacy of proposed staffing plan for various segments of the engagement, including supervision and involvement of experienced personnel.	10	10 8	10	8	9	
Adequacy of sampling techniques and audit work plan	10	8 10	10	8	9 8	
Adequacy of analytical and substantive procedures	10	9 10	9	8	9	
Pricing. Rates and expenses.	20	19.79	19.79	19.79	19.79	
Local Vendor Preference (5 Points-North Lauderdale business; 2.5 Points-Broward business)	5	0	0	0	0	
<b>TOTAL</b>	100					<b>AVERAGE</b>
<b>MEMBER TOTALS</b>		92.79	91.79	86.79	89.79	90.29

Purchasing Signature *Dke*

4/24/2020  
Date  
86.79

86.79

88.04





## EVALUATION COMMITTEE SCORING SUMMARY SCORING FORM – MARCUM LLP RANKING

Rank # 2

RFP # 20-03-390 Financial Auditing Services

<u>Criteria</u>	<u>Possible Points</u>	<u>Ana Ziade</u>	<u>Christine Cajuste</u>	<u>Peta-Gay Lake</u>	<u>Susan Gooding-Liburd</u>	
<b>Firm Qualifications</b> (past experience and performance on comparable government engagements). See section 150 (b)	25	25	25	25	25 24	
<b>Management, Supervisory and Staff Experience.</b> The quality, expertise and experience of the firm's professional personnel to be assigned to the engagement and the ability to provide the required services. See section 15 (c)	20	18 <del>18</del>	18	19	18  17	
<b>Adequacy of proposed staffing plan</b> for various segments of the engagement, including supervision and involvement of experienced personnel.	10	9  8	8	9	9	
Adequacy of sampling techniques and audit work plan	10	8 <del>8</del> 9	8	9	9	
Adequacy of analytical and substantive procedures	10	9 <del>9</del>	8	9	9	
<b>Pricing.</b> Rates and expenses.	20	17.02	17.02	17.02	17.02	
<b>Local Vendor Preference</b> (5 Points-North Lauderdale business; 2.5 Points-Broward business)	5	2.5	2.5	2.5	2.5	
<b>TOTAL</b>	100					<b>AVERAGE</b>
<b>MEMBER TOTALS</b>		89.52	86.52	90.52	89.52	89.02

Purchasing Signature

*[Signature]*

9/24/2020

87.52

Date

87.52

88.02